

contemporary incarnation, trafficking in women.

What makes her text and her arguments so compelling is the innovative and multifaceted methodology she utilizes to unearth the production and construction of the “trafficked woman.” Doezema explains that the majority of research on trafficking has made attempts at description or quantification; however, the results of such research indicate that trafficking is a phenomenon resistant to both definition and measurement. Most often, studies on trafficking pose the questions: who is being trafficked, by whom, to where, and for what purpose? Rarely has research sought to uncover the ways in which the answers to these questions become interpreted as “legitimate knowledge.” It is precisely this discursive process that is examined in *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters*. By locating “trafficking” as a particular discourse, Doezema centers her analysis on “how certain definitions of the problem become dominant, ... whose knowledge is accepted and whose sidelined, and ... the social practices involved in constructing and legitimating knowledge.”

In the opening chapter, Doezema situates her analysis of “trafficked women” in relation to myth and ideology, concepts that she uses to interrogate knowledge produced about white slavery and trafficking in women. Chapters two and three contain a historical exploration of the myth of white slavery in Britain and the United States, which lays the groundwork for the parallels drawn in the upcoming chapters. Chapter four examines early international agreements on white slavery, the first of which was signed in 1904, to be followed by further agreements throughout the first half of the twentieth century up until 1949, when the abolitionist position on prostitution was fully embraced in international law. Doezema explores how these agreements established a discursive dualism between the suffering body of the “forced” prostitute and the threatening body of the willing

prostitute who is a bearer of disorder to the nation, one that continues to be evident in the contemporary agreement. Chapter five contains an in-depth analysis of the protracted process of negotiations that led to the United Nations Protocol on trafficking, focusing on the relationships between sex workers and anti-trafficking activists.

Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters advances new conceptualizations of transnational migration, sexual labour, and consent through drawing parallels between “white slavery” and “human trafficking.” Doezema demonstrates that narratives about white slavery and the concept it is grounded in—prostitution—rely on ideologies surrounding sexuality, race, and gender for their significance. The text draws out the critical insight that debate around white slavery was formulated in the context of empire and concerns about supposed threats to the nation posed by immigrants—insights overlooked in the dominant discussions surrounding “trafficking” today. This oversight has resulted in an under-appreciation of the ways in which governments can use “trafficking” as a vehicle to advance unrelated policy goals, for example the criminalization of consensual adult sex for pay, the cessations of funding for health and human rights programs targeting HIV/AIDS, or the increased securitization of borders. Doezema also illuminates the ways in which anti-trafficking policies adopted with expressed intention of “helping” sex workers often end up (re)producing repressive and harmful consequences.

Accessible to a diverse audience of laypersons, students, researchers, and policymakers, *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters* is a significant and groundbreaking addition to the field of research on trafficking in persons and to the international literature on the topic. This text comes highly recommended.

Elya M. Durisin is a Ph.D. candidate in Political Science at York University, Toronto. Her research focuses on

Canadian anti-trafficking policy and practice. Elya is a board member at Canada's oldest sex worker-run organization, Maggie's: The Toronto Sex Workers Action Project.

Emily van der Meulen is a Post-Doctoral Fellow at the Centre for Research on Inner City Health, St. Michael's Hospital, Toronto. She holds a supplementary Post-Doctoral Fellowship with the Comparative Program on Health and Society at the University of Toronto. She is also a board member of Maggie's. Her research interests include international and Canadian sex work policies, sex industry labour organizing, and decriminalization.

SEX WORK MATTERS: EXPLORING MONEY, POWER AND INTIMACY IN THE SEX INDUSTRY

Melissa Hope Ditmore, Antonia Levy and Alys Willman, Eds.
New York: Zed Books, 2010

**REVIEWED BY NAOMI DE
SZEGHEO-LANG**

Sex Work Matters aims to bridge some of the current divides in scholarship on sex work/ers, which, according to the editors, revolve around divisions within feminism, across disciplines, and between academics and activists. Largely influenced by U.S. policy that demarcates “sex trafficking” as the most pressing aspect of the sex industry, *Sex Work Matters* challenges dominant narratives that focus on violence, abuse, and coercion. It offers alternatives to standard “mainstream” research projects that all too often frame sex workers as women who have sacrificed their good moral standing or as agentless victims and dupes of exploitative systems.

Not only do such existing accounts erase the myriad of choices people (of any and all genders) make to engage in sex work, but moralistic frameworks

also inherently assume all workers begin from a privileged position of having their perceived 'moral worth' intact and unquestioned. The reality is that many people who occupy marginalized positions do not have this luxury as a starting point—racialized people, indigenous populations, queer people, and those with chronic mental health concerns and physical disabilities have all historically, though differently, had their morality treated as suspect. This recognition, acknowledged but not elaborated upon by the book, further complicates debates around previous constructions of sex workers.

Given these considerations, the reframing called for by *Sex Work Matters* is much needed, and the intervention is an important one. Although many scholars and activists have been contributing to anti-morality and anti-trafficking discourses for some time, there is still a shortage of contemporary academic collections that reflect current research across a variety of disciplines. However, while the intent of *Sex Work Matters* is clear, the execution is inconsistent.

Several pieces in this collection build strong foundations from which to reimagine scholarly engagement with sex work/ers—notably, chapters by Laura Agustín, Jo Weldon, and Maggie O'Neill and Jane Pitcher map out potential alternative frameworks and methodologies in order to ground both the research process and results, and engage the lived experiences of sex workers in more reflective ways. Though each case presented in this book strives to challenge dominant paradigms (disciplinary, socio-cultural, legal, discursive), some do so only while continuing to uphold familiar tropes of sex workers, and/or to reinforce hierarchies of the nonparticipant researcher and the participant researched.

With the goals of *Sex Work Matters* including a creation of more dialogue across research/ers, it seems logical—indeed, perhaps imperative—that an intersectional approach be fostered. Here, a nuanced intersectional approach must mean more than simply

looking at interrelating factors of race-class-ability-gender-age-sexuality (an equation that is challenging enough for some). Intersectionality in this case should also encompass awareness and understanding of various forms of sex work and the relationships between and among them. While some chapters elucidate these linkages, others stay firmly rooted in their own cases and do not explore broader connections to other employment in the sex industry. Rather than undermine the collection, however, these shortfalls actually serve to support the editors' call for more dialogue between researchers and activists alike.

Reading from a sex-positive and sex work-positive feminist framework, *Sex Work Matters* ultimately leaves something to be desired. The analysis across chapters is inconsistent, and should be pushed further in order to better reflect debates and activism that have been occurring outside of the mainstream academy for some time now. While including different viewpoints is important in furthering dialogue, editors must pay careful attention to the ways in which they place differing approaches in conversation with one another. Ditmore, Levy and Willman tend to fall back onto a human rights discourse that glosses over differences in geopolitical location in favour of advocating for sex workers to "enjoy the same rights and conditions as anyone else." They fail to substantially ask the question, however, *who is this 'anyone else'?* This is left as an unmarked (highly privileged) group that has full access to legal, state-sanctioned support—one that is, indeed, elusive.

With that being said, the collection offers an important step in the right direction, and begins to reframe the terms for engaging research on and with sex work/ers. It is a good resource for those seeking an initial sampling of contemporary research on sex work that does not rely on narrowed visions of trafficking and calls for abolition. Readers should bring an open mind to alternative methodologies and lines of inquiry while keeping a critical eye

to potential reproduction of research inequalities. Ideally, the contributions made by *Sex Work Matters* will encourage more publications of this kind, and will continue to expand the field of sex work studies in ways that are useful to, and inclusive of, sex workers and their demands.

Naomi de Szegheo-Lang is a doctoral student in Gender, Feminist, and Women's Studies at York University. Her research areas include feminist cultural studies, queer theory, sexuality studies, and queer cultural production. Her current work takes up productive tensions between sexual citizenship, homonationalisms, affect, and feminist porn.

THE WOMEN'S MOVEMENT: INSIDE AND OUTSIDE THE STATE

Lee Ann Banaszak
New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010

REVIEWED BY LISA MAE BOUCHER

The Women's Movement: Inside and Outside the State analyses the intersection between social movements and states. Exploring the role of feminist activists located within the state bureaucracy, Lee Ann Banaszak considers the important contributions that feminist insiders made to the American women's movement from 1960-2000. Although she notes the relative weakness of the U.S. women's policy machinery in comparison with other liberal democracies, Banaszak argues that feminist insiders were dispersed across the bureaucracy and were often able to develop policies and create political opportunities which were consistent with movement goals. Critical of scholars who argue that insiders are inevitably co-opted and committed to limited