THE POLITICS OF COMMUNITY SERVICES: Immigrant Women, Class and State


Pamela King & Carmen Perillo

Ng’s book explores the process of development in a community service agency and illustrates the control exerted on this process by its funding sources. Although there is a general awareness of the powerful influence of funders on the operation of any organization, Ng extends the analysis in two ways: (1) her approach is an “institutional, ethnographic” one which looks beyond the institution itself (in this case, an employment agency for immigrant women) to consider the dynamics of the socio-political context within which the agency must function; and (2) Ng uses examples from the agency operating practices to illustrate its role in supporting the status quo, a result which is inconsistent with its stated goals. Her essential question appears to be: “Whose needs are being served?”

Her use of Marx’s and Engel’s definition of class (a social relation fundamental to and permeating capitalist productive and reproductive activities) is integral to the perspective from which she analyzes community development activity. Class issues are inherent in all activity and must be included in any examination of funding and its impact on service goals.

Her selected case is a grassroots, urban employment agency with a collectivist philosophy, serving immigrant women. Its original purpose was to support individual women in overcoming barriers to employment, while fulfilling an advocacy role to improve the overall status of immigrant women in the labour force. The latter role, especially, implies that change will occur both in the labour market and in the women themselves—the needs of each being considered, rather than socializing the clients to fit the system’s needs. In the course of her study, she observed that the agency’s role became that of a mediator between employers and the women, with the primary focus on helping the women to adapt to employers’ needs, thus ensuring a maximum number of placements and the perpetuation of the class relations.

The book presents a detailed analysis of the transformation which occurred within the agency, and the links between the demands of the funding mechanisms and the changes. Ng uses the three processes identified by Patricia Morgan (1981) in her analysis of the battered women’s movement in the US: bureaucratization, individualization and professionalization. These processes contribute to the re-definition of political problems as social ones, and the change from grassroots, community-based organizations to bureaucratic, hierarchical ones. The components of the funding and counselling processes within the agency and the influence of the state and labour market are all examined. The state’s funding requirements necessitated that the collective become incorporated, with a formally-constituted board and a clear separation of administration and counselling services. This divided staff into separate groups with different responsibilities and accountability centres. An increased expectation of quantifiable results (i.e. numbers of job placements successfully completed) by the funder initiated a shift in emphasis from the clients’ needs, as a group, for increased status in the labour market, to the funder’s requirements for clients to fill available positions in the existing labour market.

The agency began to assume a social control function: it became responsive and accountable primarily to the funder (the state), with the client becoming the marketable commodity produced by the agency.

Ng asserts that the service becomes an “extension of the state: not only through the funding requirements but through the concomitant transformation of its perspective.”

Ng’s work contains a very detailed description of the agency, and her analysis of class and state as a source of conflict within community services, and between services and the state funders, is an approach too often neglected. An expanded discussion of the conflicts, and of alternatives and preventive or ameliorative strategies for addressing the dilemma which most community services encounter, would make the book more complete.

Alliances with clients and other interest groups do not seem to have been considered as a source of support for active advocacy efforts to press for changes in the system. We suggest that the addition of the latter, and a more focused, brief discussion of theory would have made the book more interesting and of greater value to community developers, practitioners, students and researchers.

ISSEI, NISEI, WARBRIDE: Three Generations of Japanese American Women in Domestic Service


Franca Iacovetta

For Japanese American women, particularly in northern California, the association with domestic service has been an enduring one. Since the 1900s, limited job opportunities, the women’s lack of industrial skills, and systemic racism have seriously circumscribed their participation in the workforce and led to their ghettoization in domestic service. This has been true for all of the three groups of Japanese American women: the first immigrants, or Issei, many of whom arrived as young “picture brides” in the period 1915-24; the second-generation, American-born Nisei, even though many of them had trained for white collar or professional careers; and the post-World War Two warbrides who had married...